



Examining the Alignment of Single National Curriculum of Wakfiyat-E-Ama Textbooks for Grade 1-3 with Moral Values and Sustainable Development Goals

Dr. Qurratulain Rehan*, Iman Tanveer**, Kausar Rasheed***

* Assistant professor, Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore. qurratulain.rehan@kinnaird.edu.pk

** Bachelors in Education(Student), Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore. eman.tanveer1902@gmail.com

*** MPhil scholar, Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore. kausaralvi31@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Submitted 20.09.2022

Accepted 15.12.2022

Published 30.12.2022

Volume No. 9

Issue No. II

ISSN (Online) 2414-8512

ISSN (Print) 2311-293X

DOI:

Keywords: SD Goals, Moral Values, Punjab Wakfiyat-e-Ama Textbooks.

ABSTRACT

This research aimed to analyze the extent to which Punjab's Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books for grades 1 to 3 incorporate sustainable development elements and promote moral values. The study employed a qualitative research design and content analysis as the research tool, which involved systematically categorizing and analyzing the textbook content based on predefined criteria. The study revealed that topics such as peace, diversity, excellent health and wellbeing, and a sustainable way of life were given priority, while other factors such as morality, political principles, energy conservation, environmental concerns, climate change, and access to clean water received less attention. The predominant themes in the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books were honesty, mutual respect, compliance, toleration, empathetic freedom, and kind-heartedness. The study suggests that there should be a separate section at the end of each book with extracurricular moral activities to allow students to apply what they have learnt. Moreover, moral values and SDG chapters should be integrated into all subjects to expose students to these principles more extensively for their success in life. The content analysis method provided a structured approach to evaluate the textbook content and identify areas for improvement in promoting sustainable development and moral values.



Introduction

Education is a subject that can elicit varying views from different members of society. However, the characteristics of the educational process and outcomes can have a direct impact on both individuals and society as a whole since it aims to achieve specific goals at both levels. While some people may perceive sustainable development as a complicated concept that is not applicable to everyday life, it is crucial for organizations to consider society when making decisions to achieve sustainable development (Rosenbloom, 2021). Education for sustainable development (ESD) is linked to high-quality education as it equips students with the knowledge, skills, and values necessary to promote a sustainable society (Laurie et al., 2016). Sustainable development seeks to address human needs by restructuring and transforming society to support long-term sustainability (Fan et al., 2019). To ensure sustainable development, key factors from the past, present, and future must be considered, including meeting human needs, conserving natural resources, and achieving a balance between economic growth and expansion (Polasky et al., 2019). Moreover, incorporating sustainability into education can encourage students to adopt a sustainable lifestyle (Rauch F, Steiner R, 2013). Education that enables learners to acquire ethical values, competencies, and skills to transform their own lives and the communities they live in can foster sustainable development. Success in education is

achieved when a person's moral and intellectual development is nurtured (Ozturk, 2008).

Value education has long been an integral part of education, as it is believed to be a key economic and social tool that promotes the development of society (Madani, 2019). However, today's generation faces more complex challenges in terms of resource management and climate change, which require a different approach to education. The younger generation is particularly vulnerable to the effects of unsustainable practices, and promoting sustainable development and value education has become essential for achieving a sustainable future (Mukhi & Quental, 2019).

Despite the fact that sustainable development is an environmentally favorable concept that has been incorporated into our textbooks, people are unaware of its ideals and benefits (Zhang & Gibson, 2021). Sustainable development emphasizes long-term outcomes, such as environmental balance and sensible economic growth, and advocates for resource conservation (Mensah, 2019). To achieve these goals, we need to foster noble values education, as it complements sustainable development and provides direction for a career related to social advancement (Nota et al., 2020).

ESD has been a relatively unexplored area, with few empirical investigations into its effectiveness (UNESCO, 2012). However, traditional values and ethics are slowly disappearing from modern communities, and concerns have been expressed about the rise in international conflicts where peaceful resolution is not attempted (UNESCO, 2006). As such, education must aim to foster international peace and harmony.

Higher education and educational activities are seen as the first and most powerful tool for supporting sustainable development (Semet, 2020). The SD Goals, a set of objectives aimed at improving the world, must be integrated into education, with special attention paid to the younger generation. Sustainable development takes time, effort, and a willingness to change (Briceño & Santos, 2019). Only countries committed to bringing about change can help promote sustainable development. The importance of value education and sustainable development in education cannot be overstated. They are essential for creating a better future for the planet and its inhabitants.

Sustainable development attempts to build a society that is fairer and more equal for everyone in addition to achieving environmental sustainability. By providing students with the knowledge, abilities, and attitudes necessary to take an active role in affecting change in their communities, education plays a crucial role in attaining these goals.

Furthermore, implementing sustainable practices within educational institutions themselves can serve as an example for students and the wider community. This includes incorporating green technologies and practices into campus operations, such as using renewable energy sources, reducing waste, and promoting sustainable transportation. Such practices can contribute to reducing the institution's carbon footprint and promoting a culture of sustainability among students and staff. Overall, education has a crucial role to play in achieving sustainable development, and it is essential to prioritize and integrate sustainable practices and values into educational systems and institutions at all levels.

To ensure a sustainable future, it is essential to empower the youth with the values and character traits necessary for sustainable development. Sustainable development and values education complement each other, supporting a vibrant society. Goal 4 of the Sustainable Development Goals UN 2030 agenda emphasizes the importance of promoting perspectives of sustainable development and value education, leading to the creation of textbooks in this way by the education ministry (Kioupi & Voulvoulis, 2019). The UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development has reinforced the need to integrate ecological education into sustainable progress practices. Sustainable societal growth is deeply rooted in education, where the foundations of personality are built, including critical thinking abilities, moral principles, spiritual appetite, and the capacity to envision and create the future. Therefore, society requires capable academic corps with complete cultural discernment, established environmental values, and a high degree of ecological culture. The SDGs, also known as the Global Goals, encompass ambitious targets, including poverty and hunger eradication, gender equality, and providing quality education to all children. Sustainable development aims to create an ecological balance and pays special attention to future generations as they are our only hope to make the planet a better place (Mensah, 2019). UNESCO began advocating for the inclusion of sustainable development values in educational systems and programs in 2006, recognizing the effectiveness of education in transmitting these values to young people (Zguir et al., 2021). Local efforts must be made to incorporate value education and sustainable development goals into the curriculum to achieve global impact. Education has long been recognized as a tool for shaping civilizations and communities, and a common curriculum can advance both sustainable development and values education goals (Agbedahin, 2019). Incorporating fundamental sustainability concepts into textbooks is necessary for a country to commit to

sustainable development and value education.

Statement of the Problem

In order to build a sustainable future, it is important to educate and empower the youth with the values and character traits required for sustainability.

Educating students about sustainability in the classroom allows them to understand the value of ecological balance and how to attain it. This is one of the most effective strategies to achieve it. The general population will become more aware of sustainability as a result, especially the younger generations who will be influencing the future.

At the same time, fostering values in society has emerged as a key objective for social studies curricula all around the world. Schools can contribute to the creation of a more equitable and peaceful society by teaching pupils about moral behaviour, compassion, and respect for others. This is especially crucial in the context of sustainability, when problems like climate change, biodiversity loss, and resource depletion are endangering the welfare of both people and the earth.

Because of this, educating for sustainability and educating for values both contribute to a vibrant society. The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are an initiative of the United Nations, which has urged the inclusion of sustainability principles in educational systems around the world. The SDGs are a set of goals for attaining sustainable development. Schools may contribute to raising a generation of young people who are committed to constructing a sustainable and just future for all by teaching students about sustainability and fostering moral values.

Purpose

This study's main goal is to determine how much ethical standards and sustainable development are present in Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks for grades 1 to 3. This is a crucial field of research since it has a big potential to help the Punjab province's elementary school pupils promote moral principles and sustainable development goals. Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks must be written with all the SD Goals and moral values included in order to accomplish this goal. This will make it possible for pupils to grasp the fundamentals of morality from the start of their academic career. The importance of ecological balance will be taught to pupils through the inclusion of sustainability principles in the curriculum, and they will also grow in their awareness of their responsibilities to the environment and society at large. Furthermore, instilling moral principles in children from a young age can aid in the growth of morally upright people who can help to shape our society's future. Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks must therefore contain pertinent and adequate content to advance moral values and sustainable development.

Punjab Text Books

One possible reason for evaluating the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books could be the significant number of students attending public schools in Pakistan. The Punjab curriculum is followed by public schools, which educate the majority of the country's population. Therefore, it is essential to evaluate the content of these textbooks as they directly impact a large number of students, their education, and their overall development. Moreover, the evaluation of these textbooks is crucial for ensuring that the students are being taught the necessary knowledge and skills to become responsible citizens who can contribute positively to society. This evaluation can also help identify areas where improvements are required, ensuring that the textbooks are updated and relevant to the students' needs and the changing world.

Objectives

The objectives of the study were:

1. To analyze the extent to which Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books of SNC for grades 1 to 3 in Punjab incorporate the components of the Sustainable Development Goals.
2. To investigate whether moral value education is promoted in Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks of SNC which are used in primary schools (grade 1-3) in Punjab.

Research Questions

1. To what extent sustainable development goals are included in Punjab's SNC books of Wakfiyat-e-Ama for grade 1-3?
2. What values are emphasized in Punjab's SNC textbooks of Wakfiyat-e-Ama?

Literature Review

Sustainability has become a critical issue in the twenty-first century due to the challenges posed by environmental, social, and economic issues. The depletion of natural resources and the growing awareness of the impact of human activities on the planet have prompted policymakers, scholars, and educators to consider ways to promote sustainability. Sustainable development is a concept that emphasizes the

responsible use of natural resources to meet present-day demands without compromising the needs of future generations. However, the lack of a clear definition of sustainable development and its incorporation into educational systems remains a challenge.

The current situation of sustainable development education is examined in this literature review, with particular attention paid to the Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks' role in fostering sustainable values and the impact of Islamic teachings on moral education in Pakistan.

The ability to meet current demands without jeopardising the needs of future generations is referred to as sustainability, according to Verma (2019). To protect natural resources for future generations and slow down their depletion, sustainable development places a strong emphasis on ethical resource management. Regarding the problems of the twenty-first century, this strategy acknowledges the interdependence of social, economic, and environmental difficulties.

Although the term "sustainable development" is not well defined, education for it (UNESCO, 1992, 1997) encourages the development of knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values that will help to create a society that is more just and sustainable. In addition to fostering sustainable economic growth and enhancing educational systems worldwide, education can play a significant influence in influencing behaviour (Sukiennik et al., 2021).

To raise awareness among young people about environmental issues and their role in maintaining ecological balance, Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks incorporate values that support sustainability. This helps to cultivate positive attitudes towards environmental issues and encourages students to take action. Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks have been successful in teaching environmentally conscious principles and addressing topics such as global warming, pollution, climate change, recycling, ethics, and more (Shah et al., 2021).

Pakistan's moral education system emphasizes the teachings of the Quran, which contain timeless knowledge. The system encourages experimentation and discovery to foster intellectual curiosity, rationality, observation, and intellectuality. The education policies define moral education as promoting fidelity to Islam, Pakistan, and law-abiding behavior in line with Islamic teachings

Wakfiyat-e-Ama Textbooks

Wakfiyat-e-Ama is a critical subject in elementary school as it helps young students to analyze problems and make sound decisions (Russell & Waters, 2021). Social studies foster students' sense of civic responsibility. Since Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks connect to personal and social experiences, textbook-based learning helps students understand how Wakfiyat-e-Ama relates to their daily lives (Mohammed & Kinyó, 2020). Early schooling presents many social difficulties for children, and they may struggle to cope with them. Despite these challenges, school education plays a crucial role in children's growth, and Wakfiyat-e-Ama education helps them develop self-understanding and an awareness of the world around them (Epstein, 2019).

In Pakistan, the ministries of education and the environment collaborated with UNESCO from 2005 to 2014 to promote sustainable development. The district government in Badin, district Sindh, developed the first regional plan to integrate sustainable development into the elementary and tertiary curriculum. The objective of these efforts is to advance sustainable development education in Pakistan (Chohan, 2015).

Educational Initiatives for the Development Which Is Sustainable in Nature

The SDGs represent a call to action for individuals to address poverty, protect the environment, and ensure that everyone lives in peace and prosperity by 2030. The SDGs aim to eradicate poverty and inequality against women and girls, as well as hunger and AIDS, within the next 15 years. Sustainable development, including education, is a lifelong process that extends beyond formal education and encompasses lifelong learning, which provides a foundation for developing ecological awareness and an ecological culture. One of the primary objectives of ESD is to develop an ecological worldview. The development of effective educational pedagogies, their implementation, and their ability to achieve their intended purpose depend on how sustainability is defined and interpreted. Despite being a goal for education, "Sustainability" has not been adequately defined, and it is often seen as too abstract or unattainable, resulting in a lack of clarity in learning outcomes related to sustainability. ESD has been viewed differently in various contexts around the world, and there is no single formula for sustainability (UNESCO, 2012).

The Eco-Schools program is regarded as one of the best examples of ESD practices at various levels of education, both nationally and internationally, according to the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP). In this regard, significant concepts can be drawn from the practices of preschool teachers who are involved in education for the achievement of ESD goals.

Moral Education Concept

The introduction of sustainable development to young children may initially be better understood by educators and childcare specialists who are knowledgeable about ESD. They can use ESD to integrate

sustainable growth into early childhood education strategies, making it relevant to children's daily lives and actions (Green, 2013). Educators can incorporate moral lessons into their lesson plans or classroom activities by subtly instilling values through selecting and eliminating themes, encouraging students to seek the truth, establishing classroom procedures, creating groups, implementing discipline or persuasion, rewarding success, and more. The daily classroom is abundant with moral principles (Bryk, 1998; Hansen, 1993; Strike, 1996). Students' ethical beliefs can also influence their emotional intelligence, and their interpersonal skills are linked to their academic success. Empathic abilities, which include virtues, critical thinking, problem-solving, social interaction, and academic achievement, are important for students (Saphiro, 1999).

To develop relevant instructions and learning strategies and evaluate the progress of implementing these skills as learning outcomes, the process should identify the competencies needed to realize the vision. This highlights the need for teaching moral principles in our educational system. Researchers are hopeful that integrating moral guidance into our curriculum will raise student achievement while reducing moral decay in our society. Educational systems that allow students the opportunity to equip themselves with moral ideals, useful information, and the necessary skills to make a difference in their lives and communities aid in achieving sustainability.

Primary Education

Grades one through six comprise primary education, which is the official education provided to students between the ages of six and eleven (Varjo et al., 2019). The primary curriculum should be written in a way that enables pupils to readily understand complicated topics in their higher education. As pupils are still developing, primary education can have a lasting impact on their lives (Maksymchuk et al., 2020). Textbooks are connected to the curriculum since they offer instructions and content for achieving academic objectives (Ayu & Inderawati, 2019). Shah (2020) contrasted this by pointing out that a well-designed textbook aids student in studying in a way that is enjoyable and engaging. Textbooks can help students envision topics and interests, and appealing information formats should be used to pique students' interest in learning.

Incorporating SD Goals in Curriculum

Students must acquire information and skills to cope with globalization, especially teachers and educators responsible for their instruction (Goodwin, 2021). As educational needs of the 21st century continue to evolve, the curriculum must reflect these changes and be developed or revised accordingly (Ahmad et al., 2019). Goodwin (2020) argues that a comprehensive curriculum focused on education and cultural adaptation, along with the professional development of teachers, is crucial for optimal learning outcomes. Sustainable development must be introduced to children from an early age, and all stakeholders must collaborate in developing strategies for its curricular promotion. To educate students about sustainability and preserve natural resources for future generations, Hays and Reinders (2020) suggest incorporating sustainable development into the curriculum. In contrast, Schneider et al. (2018) note that although many educational institutions around the world include ESD in their curricula and conduct research on it, sustainable notions are incorporated differently into curricula worldwide. Coaching on sustainable growth in higher education is necessary in every country, including Sweden. Finland and Manitoba have already incorporated sustainable education into their curriculum (Finnveden et al., 2020). However, in Pakistan, only 5% of teaching materials or curricula focus on sustainable development goals or sustainability, indicating a lack of emphasis on this concept (Kalsoom and Qureshi, 2021). Asif et al. (2020) argue that instilling sustainable development is necessary for Pakistan's education system to have a sustainable future. Although the curriculum in Pakistan has been refocused on sustainable development to promote diversity and peace, it has not been done effectively. Moral education is necessary for sustainable future developments as it enhances children's analytical and critical thinking skills related to this subject.

Research Methodology

Research Design

This study is designed using a qualitative research approach. Van Maanen (1979) defines qualitative research as "a generic term for a variety of interpretive methods intended to explain, decode, translate, and otherwise comprehend the meaning of naturally occurring phenomena in social contexts rather than their frequency."

Research Tool

For the present study, the document analysis technique was chosen to evaluate the Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks of grades 1-3 in Punjab. This method was chosen because it helps researchers to evaluate available resources and select studies that best fit their research agendas. Document analysis allows for the organization and categorization of detailed non-numerical information, making it an advantageous technique

(Longo, 2019). Moreover, it is a highly useful technique for producing reliable and repeatable conclusions from the data (Selvi, 2019).

In document analysis, scholars examine documents to give a topic under evaluation a voice and meaning. Content analysis is utilized to assess their contents properly. With the approach of content analysis, researchers can investigate the presence of particular terms and themes in the text. The researchers utilized a coding system to signify elements related to sustainable development and moral ideals, and all researchers read the textbooks and tagged items according to the classification method to prevent subjectivity. The objects were given a frequency and then labelled.

To identify the aspects of sustainable development and moral principles, colour highlighters were employed. Different colours were assigned to various SDGoals and moral values topics. If aspects of SDG and moral values were conveyed through visuals and had an appropriate chapter, they were noted to a large extent. If only a few subjects regarding SDG and moral values were presented in a chapter, they were labelled as to a certain extent. If a chapter merely presented only a few sentences concerning SDG components and moral principles, it was labelled as having a limited scope.

Overall, the document analysis technique was effectively used to evaluate the Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks of grades 1-3 in Punjab and determine the extent to which they emphasized sustainable development goals and moral values. The coding system and use of colour highlighters allowed for the identification of key themes and patterns in the data, providing valuable insights for the study.

Results

Table 4.1 Content Analysis of Class I Wakfiyat-e-Ama Textbook of SNC for Sustainable Development

Sustainable Development Goals	To a great extent	To some extent	To a little extent	Not at all
1. Peace and Justice			✓	
2. Highlighting Importance of Diversity		✓		
3. Integrity			✓	
4. Political Values				✓
5. Energy Conservation				✓
6. Environmental Issues				✓
7. Addressing Poverty (Food Preservation and Economic crisis)				✓
8. Types of Professions				✓
9. Climate Action (Climate Change)				✓
10. Good Health and Well being	✓			
11. Gender Equality				✓
12. Life on Land			✓	
13. Life Below Water (Water Crisis)				✓
14. Clean Water and Sanitation				✓

Table 4.2 Results of Content Analysis of Wakfiyat-E-Ama Textbook of SNC Of Class I For Moral Values.

Value Education (Moral Values)	To a great extent	To some extent	To a little extent	Not at All
1. Honesty			✓	
2. Modesty			✓	
3. Cooperation			✓	
4. Mutual Respect			✓	
5. Obedience			✓	
6. Empathy			✓	
7. Tolerance				
8. Kindheartedness			✓	
9. Cleanliness of body and mind	✓			
10. Freedom				✓
11. Courage				✓
12. Public Spiritedness				✓
13. Humility			✓	

Table 4.3 Content Analysis of Class II Wakfiyat-e-Ama Textbook of SNC for Sustainable Development

Sustainable Development	To a great extent	To some extent	To a little extent	Not at All
1. Peace and Justice			✓	
2. Highlighting Importance of Diversity	✓			
3. Integrity				✓
4. Political Values				✓
5. Energy Conservation				✓
6. Environmental Issues		✓		
7. Addressing Poverty (Food Preservation and Economic crisis)				✓
8. Types of Professions	✓			
9. Climate Action (Climate Change)				✓
10. Good Health and Well being				✓
11. Gender Equality				✓
12. Life on Land			✓	
13. Life Below Water (Water Crisis)			✓	
14. Clean Water and Sanitation	✓			

Table 4.4 Results of Content Analysis of Wakfiyat-E-Ama Textbook of SNC of Class II for Moral Values.

Value Education (Moral Values)	To a great extent	To some extent	To a Little extent	Not at all
1. Honesty				✓
2. Modesty				✓
3. Cooperation			✓	
4. Mutual Respect			✓	
5. Obedience			✓	
6. Empathy				✓
7. Tolerance				✓
8. Kind-heartedness			✓	
9. Cleanliness of body and mind			✓	
10. Freedom				✓
11. Courage				✓
12. Public Spiritedness				✓
13. Humility			✓	

Table 4.5 Results of Content Analysis of Class III Wakfiyat-e-Ama Textbook of SNC for Sustainable Development.

Sustainable Development	To A Great Extent	To Some Extent	To A Little Extent	Not at All
1. Peace and Justice	✓			
2. Highlighting Importance of Diversity				✓
3. Integrity			✓	
4. Political Values			✓	
5. Energy Conservation			✓	
6. Environmental Issues	✓			
7. Addressing Poverty (Food Preservation and Economic Crisis)				✓
8. Types of professions				✓
9. Climate Action (Climate change)				✓
10. Good health and well being		✓		
11. Gender Equality			✓	
12. Life on Land		✓		
13. Life below water (Water Crisis)		✓		
14. Clean water and Sanitation		✓		

Table 4.6 Results of Content Analysis of Wakfiyat-E-Ama Textbook of SNC of Class III for Moral Values.

Value Education (Moral values)	To A Great Extent	To Some Extent	To A Little Extent	at	Not All
1. Honesty			✓		
2. Modesty			✓		
3. Cooperation					✓
4. Obedience			✓		
5. Mutual respect			✓		
6. Empathy			✓		
7. Tolerance			✓		
8. Kind-heartedness			✓		
9. Cleaning of body and mind			✓		
10. Freedom					✓
11. Courage					✓
12. Public spiritedness			✓		
13. Humility					✓

Findings

I. The Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books of Class 1 covers the SD Goals of "good health and wellbeing", to a great extent. "High lighting the importance of diversity" is covered to some extent. "peace and justice", and "life on land" and "integrity" are covered to a little extent whereas rest of the topics are not covered at all.

II. In the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books Class 2 textbook, "Highlighting the Importance of Diversity", "types of profession" and "clean water and sanitation" are the most covered goal, while "environmental issues" is covered to some extent. "peace and justice", "life on land" and "life below water" are covered to a little extent whereas the rest of the topics are not even touched in the book.

III. In the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books Class 3 textbook, the most covered goals are "peace and justice" and "environmental issues", while the goals covered to some extent are "good health and wellbeing", "life on land" and "life below water". "integrity", "political values", "energy conservation" and "gender equity" are the goals which are covered to a little extent while the rest are totally missed from the text book.

VI. In the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books Class 1 textbook, the most covered values are "Mutual Respect," "Kindheartedness," and "Cleanliness of Body and Mind," while the least covered values are "Obedience", "empathy", "kind-heartedness", "humility", "modesty", "mutual respect" and "cooperation". The rest of the topics of moral values are not present in the book.

VII. In the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books Class 2 textbook, the least covered values are "Cooperation" "mutual respect", "obedience", "kind heartedness", "humility" and "cleanliness of body and mind". while the rest of the moral values are totally absent from the book.

VIII. In the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text book of Class 3 the least covered moral values are "honesty", "modesty", "obedience", "mutual respect", "empathy", "tolerance", "kind heartedness", "cleanliness of body and mind", "Public Spiritedness" while the rest are not present at all.

The sustainable development goals were only present to a limited extent, and even when present, they were difficult to identify. Themes like energy conservation, environmental issues, and climate action were present, but not given sufficient importance within the chapters and were often neglected. Some textbooks placed greater emphasis on inculcating moral values compared to sustainable development goals.

Discussion

The study's results revealed a significant disparity in the coverage of sustainable development themes and moral ideals in Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books for grades 1-3. Specifically, textbooks for grades 2 and 3 were found to be at short of maximum of moral values. These books include some part of sustainable development themes as compared to the moral values.

The concept of sustainability encompasses the preservation of natural systems' capacity to provide the resources and services necessary for human growth and civilization. In contrast, morals refer to organized and precise notions that ensure an individual's connection with their surroundings.

The study's first research question investigated the extent to which Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks for grades 1-3 covered sustainable development themes. The results showed that the textbooks placed more emphasis on components such as peace and justice, environmental issue, highlighting the importance of diversity, types of profession, clean water and sanitation and good health and wellbeing. Conversely, there was less coverage of themes such as honesty, political principles, energy conservation, environmental

concerns, climate action, and clean water. The study's findings were consistent with previous research conducted by Rampedi (2017), who also identified these principles as foundational components of social studies textbooks. However, important topics such as poverty, occupations, gender equity, and life below water were entirely missing from the textbooks.

Similar findings were reported by Yalcinkaya and Elvan (2013), who studied sustainability issues in Turkey's basic social studies textbooks. They recommended revising the social studies curriculum to include key components of sustainable development, given that these were lacking in the textbooks.

In conclusion, the study highlights the need for a more comprehensive and balanced approach to social studies education in Punjab. It suggests that greater attention should be given to sustainable development themes and moral values across all grades to better equip students with the knowledge and skills necessary for a more sustainable and just society

The second research question of this study aimed to investigate the moral ideals highlighted in Pakistani primary school social studies textbooks. The study's results revealed that numerous moral values, including honesty, mutual respect, obedience, tolerance, empathy, freedom, kindness and cleanliness of body and mind are incorporated into Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks. These findings are consistent with Alelaimat and Taha's (2013) research, which was conducted on 10th-grade students from 2004 to 2010. Their study indicated that empathy, honesty, and loyalty were the most prevalent values in the textbooks, followed by values for economic development, social values, and ultimately values for tolerance. The study's author suggested that loyalty and honesty were the most important values in Jordanian social studies education curricula, as they help prepare students for loyalty to their country, society, and people by instilling political awareness and identity through the curriculum.

However, the study also revealed that several components of sustainable development were missing from the textbooks due to repetition of chapters from previous textbooks. As a result, teachers lacking basic understanding of sustainable development would be unable to identify or emphasize key areas that contribute to long-term growth. Similar to the findings of this study, Glavi's (2020) research emphasized the need to revise the Wakfiyat-e-Ama curriculum and teacher training, as it lacks the fundamental ingredients of sustainable development. The study's findings also indicated that the components of energy conservation, environmental issues, and climate action were mostly absent and neglected in the textbooks, which contradicts the findings that made these elements the centre or core of the Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books. Mathetsa et al.'s (2022) research supports this conclusion, as their findings indicate that these components are vital aspects of sustainable development.

Furthermore, this study's findings indicate that one moral characteristic missing from Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks is courage. Research has shown that the foundations of personality are created and values are developed in primary school. The third-year class in the primary education section of the education faculties' social studies teaching program includes a unit on values education. Values education is now a part of primary school curricula, and in the new primary/elementary education programs at schooling faculties for the 2018–2019 academic year, it has been added as a separate topic in the fourth grade under the term "Character and Value Education." Armstrong's (2020) research suggests that moral principles and SDGs are linked and serve as a ladder for one another since ethical decision-making techniques assist individuals in examining SDG targets. Therefore, learning about moral principles and sustainable development goals is critical.

Conclusion and Recommendations

In conclusion, this study highlights the importance of including sustainable development objectives in Wakfiyat-e-Ama textbooks. While certain aspects related to good health and integrity are already included, the study found that there is still a significant gap in the coverage of components such as energy conservation, environmental issues, climate action, and safe drinking water. The most common values in Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books were honesty, mutual respect, obedience, tolerance, empathy, freedom, and compassion.

This study provides valuable insights for future research investigations on a similar topic. It also suggests that future research could evaluate other factors pertinent to the subject of interest, such as environmental concerns acting as a barrier to sustainable growth.

Overall, the broad reach of this study, covering social studies course materials from classes 1-5 and the board's consideration of all areas, makes it a worthy inclusion in future research. By incorporating sustainable development goals and promoting moral principles, Wakfiyat-e-Ama education can play a critical role in preparing students to become responsible global citizens.

One important point to consider is the role of teachers in promoting sustainable development goals

and moral values in the classroom. While textbooks play a crucial role in shaping students' understanding of these concepts, it is ultimately up to the teacher to bring these ideas to life and encourage critical thinking and reflection. Therefore, teacher training and professional development programs should focus on equipping educators with the knowledge and skills necessary to effectively teach about sustainable development and moral values in the classroom. By doing so, teachers can help foster a generation of responsible and conscientious global citizens who are committed to creating a better world for all.

Limitations

Limitations of the present study are as follow:

- This study was limited only to the analysis of the curriculum of grade 1 to 3
- This study was limited only to the content analysis of Wakfiyat-e-Ama text books. Other publishers' books should also be the part of the study which are being taught in our country's context.
- Other subjects which are incorporating the moral values and SD Goals should also be comprised into the study as they are also doing the same job for the development of moral values and SD goals for the education.

References

- Ahmad, M. K., Adnan, A. H. M., Azamri, N. M., Idris, K. B., Norafand, N. N., & Ishak, N. I. (2019, February). Education 4.0 technologies for English language teaching and learning in the Malaysian context. In Proceedings of the International Invention, Innovative & Creative (InIIC) Conference 2019 (pp. 6-16). MNNF Publisher.
- Alelaimat, A. R., & Taha, K. (2013). Sustainable development and values education in the Jordanian social studies curriculum. *Education, 134*(2), 135.
- Armstrong, A. (2020). Ethics and ESG. *Australasian Accounting, Business and Finance Journal, 14*(3), 6-17.
- Asif, T., Guangming, O., Haider, M. A., Colomer, J., Kayani, S., & Amin, N. U. (2020). Moral education for sustainable development: Comparison of university teachers' perceptions in China and Pakistan. *Sustainability, 12*(7), 3014.
- Ayu, M., & Inderawati, R. (2019). EFL textbook evaluation: The analysis of tasks presented in English textbook. *Teknosastik, 16*(1), 21-25.
- Briceño, C. E. B., & Santos, F. C. A. (2019). Knowledge management, the missing piece in the 2030 agenda and SDGs puzzle. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education, 20*(5), 901-916.
- Brisman, A. (2019). The fable of the three little pigs: Climate change and green cultural criminology. *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy, 8*(1), 46-69.
- Bryk, A. S. (1998). Musing on the moral life of school. *American journal of education, 96* (2), 256-290.
- Çengelci, T. Ve & Hancı, B. (2013). Teachers 'and Students' Views on Values Education in School Environment. *Journal of Values Education Cilt 11*(25) 33-56
- Chohan, B. I. (2015). A Comparative Study of Elementary Level Urdu Curriculum in terms of Socio-cultural and Environmental Perspectives of Education for Sustainable Development. *FWU Journal of Social Sciences, 9*(2), 95-100.
- Epstein, J. L. (2019). Theory to practice: School and family partnerships lead to school improvement and student success. In *School, family and community interaction* (pp. 39-52). Routledge.
- Fan, J., Wang, Y., Wang, C., Chen, T., Jin, F., Zhang, W., ... & Guo, R. (2019). Reshaping the sustainable geographical pattern: A major function zoning model and its applications in China. *Earth's Future, 7*(1), 25-42.
- Finnveden, G., Friman, E., Mogren, A., Palmer, H., Sund, P., Carstedt, G., ... & Svärd, L. (2020). Evaluation of integration of sustainable development in higher education in Sweden. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education, 21*(4), 685-698.
- Glavič, P. (2020). Identifying key issues of education for sustainable development. *Sustainability, 12*(16), 6500.
- Goodwin, A. L. (2020). Globalization, global mindsets and teacher education. *Action in Teacher Education, 42*(1), 6-18.
- Hansen, D. T. (1993). From role to person: The moral layeredness of classroom teaching. *American educational research journal, 30*, 651-674.
- Hays, J., & Reinders, H. (2020). Sustainable learning and education: A curriculum for the future. *International Review of Education, 66*(1), 29-52.
- Ifegbesan, A. P., Lawal, M. B., & Rampedi, I. T. (2017). The Nigeria Teachers Social Studies Training Curriculum and Sustainable Development Goals: A Content Analysis. *Journal of International Social Studies, 7*(1), 92-122.
- Ogelman, H. & Sarıkaya, H. (2015). The Opinions of Preschool Education Teachers on Values Education:

- The Case of Denizli Province. *Sakarya University Faculty of Education Journal*, (29), 81-100.
- Kalsoom, Q., & Qureshi, N. (2021). Impact of sustainability-focused learning intervention on teachers' agency to teach for sustainable development. *International Journal of Sustainable Development & World Ecology*, 28(6), 540-552.
- Karim, T. (2021). Gendered Perceptions of Climate Change and Climate Action-A Comparative Study among Bangladeshi and Norwegian University Students Studying and Living in Norway (Master's thesis, The University of Bergen).
- Kioupi, V., & Voulvoulis, N. (2019). Education for sustainable development: A systemic framework for connecting the SDGs to educational outcomes. *Sustainability*, 11(21), 6104.
- Kolaç, E. (2010). Education Of Values And Tolerance In Turkish Lessons With The Philosophy Of Hacı Bektaş Veli, Mevlana And Yunus. *Turkish Culture and Journal of Hacı Bektaş Veli Research*, 55, 193-208
- Kroeger, A., Siebold, N., Günzel-Jensen, F., Saade, F. P., & Heikkilä, J. P. (2022). Tackling grand challenges collaboratively: The role of value-driven sensegiving. In *Organizing for societal grand challenges*. Emerald Publishing Limited.
- Laurie, R.; Nonoyama-Tarumi, Y.; Mckeown, R.; Hopkins, C. Contributions of education for sustainable development (ESD) to quality education: A synthesis of research. *J. Educ Sustain. Dev.* 2016, 10, 226–242. [CrossRef]
- Leal Filho, W., Raath, S., Lazzarini, B., Vargas, V. R., de Souza, L., Anholon, R., Quelhas, O.L.G., Haddad, R., Klavins, M., & Orlovic, V. L. (2018). The role of transformation in learning and education for sustainability. *Journal of cleaner production*, 199, 286- 295.
- Longo, L. (2019, October). Empowering qualitative research methods in education with artificial intelligence. In *World Conference on Qualitative Research* (pp. 1-21). Springer, Cham.
- Madani, R. A. (2019). Analysis of Educational Quality, a Goal of Education for All Policy. *Higher Education Studies*, 9(1), 100-109.
- Mathetsa, S. M., Simatele, M. D., & Rampedi, I. T. (2022). Applying the participatory approach to assess the Water-Energy-Climate Change nexus in South Africa. *Development Southern Africa*, 1-17.
- Mensah, J. (2019). Sustainable development: Meaning, history, principles, pillars, and implications for human action: Literature review. *Cogent social sciences*, 5(1), 1653531.
- Mohammed, S. H., & Kinyó, L. (2020). The role of constructivism in the enhancement of social studies education. *Journal of critical reviews*, 7(7), 249-256.
- Nota, L., Soresi, S., Di Maggio, I., Santilli, S., & Ginevra, M. C. (2020). Sustainable development, career counselling and career education. Springer International Publishing.
- Olabi, A. G., Obaideen, K., Elsaid, K., Wilberforce, T., Sayed, E. T., Maghrabie, H. M., & Abdelkareem, M. A. (2022). Assessment of the pre-combustion carbon capture contribution into sustainable development goals SDGs using novel indicators. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 153, 111710.
- Ozturk, I. The role of education in economic development: A theoretical perspective. *SSRN Electron. J.* 2008. [CrossRef]
- Polasky, S., Kling, C. L., Levin, S. A., Carpenter, S. R., Daily, G. C., Ehrlich, P. R., Heal, G.M., & Lubchenco, J. (2019). Role of economics in analyzing the environment and sustainable development. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 116(12), 5233-5238.
- Rauch, F.; Steiner, R. Competences for education for sustainable development in teacher education. *Cent. Educ. Policy Stud. J.* 2013, 3, 9–24.
- Rogayan Jr, D. V. (2019). I heart nature: Perspectives of university students on environmental stewardship. *International Journal on Engineering, Science and Technology*, 1(1), 10-16.
- Rosenbloom, A. (2021). The Sustainability Marketing Framework: A Tool for Teaching and Learning about Sustainability Marketing. In *Social and Sustainability Marketing* (pp. 13-52). Productivity Press.
- Russell, W. B., & Waters, S. (2021). *Essentials of elementary social studies*. Routledge.
- Schneider, P., Folkens, L., & Busch, M. (2018). The teaching-research-practice nexus as framework for the implementation of sustainability in curricula in higher education. In *Implementing Sustainability in the Curriculum of Universities* (pp. 113- 136). Springer, Cham.
- Selvi, A. F. (2019). Qualitative content analysis. In *The Routledge handbook of research methods in applied linguistics* (pp. 440-452). Routledge.
- Semet, R. (2020). The Social Issue of ESG Analysis. Available at SSRN 3838372.
- Strike, K. (1996). The moral responsibilities of educators. In J. Sikula, T. Buttery & E. Grifton (eds.),

- Handbook of research teacher education. (2nd Ed., p.869-882). New York: Macmillan.
- Shah, R. K. (2020). Concepts of learner-centred teaching. Shah, RK (2020). Concepts of Learner-Centred Teaching. Shanlax International Journal of Education, 8(3), 45-60.
- Shah, S. M. A., Jiang, Y., Wu, H., Ahmed, Z., Ullah, I., & Adebayo, T. S. (2021). Linking green human resource practices and environmental economics performance: the role of green economic organizational culture and green psychological climate. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 18(20), 10953.
- Sukiennik, M., Zybała, K., Fuksa, D., & Kęsek, M. (2021). The role of universities in sustainable development and circular economy strategies. Energies, 14(17), 5365.
- UNESCO. International, Moral and Value Education; United Nations Report; UNESCO: Paris, France, 2006; Available online: <http://www.unescobkk.org/index.php?id=598> (accessed on 25 October 2019).
- UNESCO. Shaping the Education of Tomorrow; 2012 Report on the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development, Abridged; UNESCO: Paris, France, 2012; p. 89.
- Veugelers, W. & Vedder P. (2003). Values in teaching. *Teachers and Teaching: theory and practice*, 9, 377-389.
- Varjo, J., Kalalahti, M., & Kauko, J. (2019). Overview of Primary Education (Finland). Bloomsbury Education and Childhood Studies.
- Yalcinkava, E. (2013). Analyzing primary social studies curriculum of turkey in terms of unesco educational for sustainable development theme. *European Journal of Sustainable Development*. 2(4). 215-215.
- Yeşil, R. & Aydın, D. (2007). Method and timing in the education of democratic values. *Turkey Social Research Journal*, 11(2), 65-84.
- Zguir, M. F., Dubis, S., & Koç, M. (2021). Embedding Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) and SDGs values in curriculum: A comparative review on Qatar, Singapore and New Zealand. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 319, 128534.
- Zhang, H., & Gibson, H. J. (2021). Long-term impact of study abroad on sustainability-related attitudes and behaviors. *Sustainability*, 13(4), 1953