



Challenges and Opportunities of Competency-Based Training in Art & Design: Pakistani Teachers' Perspective

Mohni Saif *, Irha Ali **, Farzana Rashid ***

*Principal, STEP Institute of Art, Design & Management, Lahore, Pakistan. mohni.saif@step.edu.pk

**Program Coordinator & Instructor-Art & Design, IVY College of Management Sciences, Lahore, Pakistan.

irha.ali.lhr@rootsivy.edu.pk

***Department of zoology, Lahore college for women University, Lahore. dr.farzanarashid@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Submitted 07.03.2023

Accepted 03.06.2023

Published 30.06.2023

Volume No. 10

Issue No. I

ISSN (Online) 2414-8512

ISSN (Print) 2311-293X

DOI:

Keywords:

Keywords: Globalisation, Workforce, Economic competitiveness, CBT (Competency-Based Training), Art & Design Education, Curriculum Implementation

ABSTRACT

Globalisation has demanded expert labour markets, diversified skills, and high levels of vocational education. To refine the skills and knowledge of the people is central to gaining and sustaining economic empowerment, particularly in the context of continuing globalisation. CBT is based on specific, measurable objectives related directly to instructional activities. In favourable situations and settings, The passage discusses the effectiveness of Competency-Based Training (CBT) as a training methodology, but emphasizes that it is not the only approach to designing training. It suggests that trainers and curriculum consultants should have a clear understanding of the concept and standards underlying CBT and other curriculum models to design more effective programs. This study also highlights the significance of Art & Design Education and Training in the development of a country, and how CBT can be used to provide learners with the necessary knowledge, skills, and attitude. The success of competency training is said to depend on effective curriculum implementation. This case study explores the challenges and opportunities of Competency-Based Training in Art & Design from the perspectives of Pakistani teachers.



Introduction

There is a scarcity of research on the challenges faced by teacher educators in terms of the challenges and opportunities of Competency-Based Training in Art & Design in Punjab, Pakistan. The current study will contribute to that literature.

Competency-Based Training: The full range of activities that emphasize the knowledge, skills and attributes an individual needs to succeed in the workplace in accordance with standards set by the industry.

Competency-based training was introduced in the 1980s and is now being recognised globally by human resource development (HRD) institutes and departments. According to Naquin and Holton (2003), competency-based training emphasizes objectives that are measurable and stated behaviourally. Competencies in Art & Design are obtained in numerous ways, such as hands-on learning, pre-service and in-service training, and authentic situations. Competency-based training (CBT) has become very popular over the last decade, particularly in the field of higher education (Achtenhagen, 2001).

Objectives of CBT:

"CBT is intended at providing students with the knowledge, skills, and attitudes to enable the learners to recognise and solve complex problems in their domain of study or future work, i.e., authentic tasks" (Keen, 1992). Knowledge-based education emphasizes concepts whereas, within CBT the questions of why something has to be learned and how the education can be used in solving multifaceted problems of real life are considered important.

Key topics of CBT:

Application of knowledge, analysing the problem and providing solutions to the problem are key subjects of CBT. "The successful realisation of CBT profoundly depends on the teachers, who are likely to give up their role as knowledge transmitters and assume the new roles of a coach" (Enkenberg, 2001), and "instructional designer" (Tennyson, 2001). Mostly, as instructional designers, teachers are also expected to explicate new curricula into a purposeful set of learning exercises (Keen, 1992). In the field of Art & Design, this kind of learning assignment is considered the teachers' major design challenge during the transition process from information- to competency-based training (Hoogveld et al., 2001). It is observed that teachers are not professionally prepared with the appropriate skills for this elaborate design assignment. (William, 2018).

CBT in Pakistan:

Competency-based training (CBT) has become an important focus in vocational education in developing countries(William,2018) Research highlighting a gap between academic and practical resources in vocational training institutes. Zinn et al(2019) In Pakistan, vocational institute teachers have practical skills but require professional training to deliver CBT effectively(Ahmed& Sayed (2021).CBT aims to integrate practical skills with competency-based training to create a diverse learning model, with skilled trainers needed to effectively transmit CBT curricula Osman&Kamis(2019) Pakistan's National Skills Strategy aims to transform TVET into skill-based and practical training, introducing CBT & A through private and government institutes

. The introduction of CBT is a significant component of the National Skills Strategy and provides the basis for the National Vocational Qualifications Framework, which empowers trainees to get their skills evaluated and acknowledged. CBT is student-centered, unlike the traditional teacher-centered approach in Pakistan's education system, with progression based on knowledge and interest rather than time.

Through blended learning methods, technical educators are skilled in industrial (Khan et al., 2022). According to Omer et al. (2020), the CBT curriculum is 70% practical and 30% theoretical and it can only be transmitted by trained and skilled trainers.

Pakistan's National Skills Strategy (NSS) aims to revolutionize the country's Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system by shifting it from a theoretical-based to a practical and skill-based approach. To achieve this objective, the National Vocational & Technical Training Commission (NAV TTC) has collaborated with Provincial Technical Education & Vocational Training Authorities (TEVTAs) to introduce relevant courses, supplementary materials, and establish skill standards for vocational training in Pakistan.

Competency-Based Training and Assessment (CBT&A) has been jointly introduced by private institutions and government departments, including the Punjab Vocational Training Council (PVTTC), Technical Education & Vocational Training Authorities (TEVTAs), and the Punjab Board of Technical Education. CBT&A is a crucial component of the NSS, and its introduction has facilitated the transformation of the TVET sector in Pakistan. Furthermore, the NSS also provides the foundation for the implementation of the National Vocational Qualifications Framework (NVQF), which offers trainees more employment opportunities by setting competency models under NVQF. This policy empowers the workforce by recognizing and accrediting their previous skills and abilities acquired through CBT.

The educational system in Pakistan follows the conventional teacher-centred approach, whereas the CBT framework is learner-centred. In the traditional system, the unit of progression is time, whereas in CBT, the unit of progression is the learners' knowledge and interests (Mohan & Summed, 2012). The NSS's integration of CBT has brought about a paradigm shift in the TVET sector of Pakistan, creating opportunities for individuals to develop relevant skills and gain employment.(Mohan&Summed,2012)

Purpose Statement:

The purpose of this study is to examine teachers' perspectives on CBE (competency-based education) in the area of Art & Design and the challenges and opportunities in Pakistan.

Research Questions:

- 1- What are the challenges faced in implementing competency-based training in Art & Design Education in Pakistan?

2- What are the opportunities for competency-based training in Art & Design Education in Pakistan?

Methodology

In this research, a single case study has been used because the researcher wanted to cover "the contextual conditions". The case study "builds an in-depth, contextual understanding of the case, relying on multiple data sources" (Yin, 2009).

It has been chosen because the research aims at exploring the 'perspectives' of Pakistani teachers about the challenges and opportunities of Competency-Based Training in Art & Design.

This is done with Art & Design teachers from the Institute of Art, Design, and Management, a Pakistani vocational institute because CBT (competency-based training) is implemented in this institute. The data is collected randomly. The data is collected through open-ended questions and some demographic questions. The data is analyzed through open coding.

This research uses a qualitative method for data collection. As "O'Reilly (2005) pointed out that quantitative methods might provide us with the skeleton, but only qualitative methods can give us the flesh and the soul." Interviews were conducted to gather primary from the teachers of the Institute of Art, Design, and Management in Lahore.

Population:

Only the IADM (Art & Design teachers from the Institute of Art, Design, and Management) vocational institute in Lahore has been chosen for this specific case study.

Sample:

The sample for this study comprises 10 (five male & five female) teachers who are teaching at the IADM vocational institute. Purposive sampling has been done for the current study to know teacher perceptions. The purposive sampling approach necessitates the researcher to possess prior comprehension of their study's objective to effectively select and approach possible participants.

Interviewing is the fundamental data collection tool for qualitative research (Moustakas, 1994; Giorgi, 2009). For this study, 10 interviews with the teachers at IADM, a vocational institute were conducted. The interview was developed by the researcher through a literature review.

The Interview Protocol:

The interview protocol includes the following questions:

- 1- How would you describe Competency-Based Training in Art & Design?
- 2- What are the key elements of Competency-Based Training in Art & Design?
- 3- Why is Competency-Based Training in Art & Design important?
- 4- What are the challenges to implementing competency-based training in Pakistan for Art & Design?
- 5- What are the opportunities for competency-based training in Pakistan for Art & Design?

Ethical Consideration:

The Faculty of the School of Education, University of Management and Technology approved topic of the study before conducting the study. The questions designed for the questionnaire use inclusive language. The identity of the respondents is confidential and participation in the study is voluntary. The researchers shared the purpose of the study with the potential respondents.

Findings

The following themes that emerged from interview data on the question about challenges are discussed below:

Lack of Teacher Training

The majority of the interviewees mentioned that the biggest challenge in CBT is teachers' training, as the teachers are not well prepared to convey CBT in their classrooms.

One participant mentioned that: "Teachers are not fully aware of what CBT is and how to train the students keeping CBT in mind". Teachers' reluctance to use CBT, Most of the interviewees said that another challenge in implementing CBT is that trainers are reluctant to devise CBT methods in their lessons.

An interviewee said: "Some of the teachers are unwilling to get out of their comfort zone and implement CBT in professional courses".

Another interviewee stated: "I observed the lack of acceptance of CBT amongst teachers, actually the teachers are at ease with traditional methods of teaching, I think this is one of the challenges of implementing CBT."

Lack of well-equipped studios:

Some of the respondents mentioned that the Art & Design studios are not well equipped and up to the market competent standards.

One teacher stated that: "The purpose of CBT is to prepare the students to work in the industry, how can

we prepare our students when the studios are not equipped according to the needs of the current industry.”

Following are the themes that emerged from interview data on the question about opportunities are discussed below:

Better Opportunities:

The majority of the participants mentioned that those students who take CBT get better job opportunities. One of the respondents said: “Students get better job opportunities when their training is competency-based, their pay scales and designations are far better than those who are trained in the traditional way.”

Skilled workforce:

Discussing the opportunities of CBT in Pakistan many interviewees stated that CBT is providing a skilled technical and vocational workforce to the industry. A respondent pointed out that: “After completing CBT students are able to directly work in the industry without having any experience in the industry.”

Enhanced learning:

Highlighting the opportunities of CBT most of the participants mentioned that:

“CBT in Art & Design gives the artists space to showcase their talent and connect with the audience, it boosts the confidence by providing professional development.” Another participant said: “CBT enhances critical thinking amongst the learners and opens up the opportunities of Entrepreneurship.”

Conclusion

Based on the results and the discussions above, the researcher would like to draw the following conclusions:

Competency-based Training (CBT) has become a core strategy in Pakistan and internationally as a means to educate and assess the next generation of vocational training institutes students. The competency-based training (CBT) has been outlined in this paper, CBT is a cohesive approach which has vast possibilities for learning at all levels. CBT prioritizes social-oriented professional training that takes place in authentic settings such as workplaces, and provides early opportunities for skill development.

It also emphasizes the importance of integrating practical training with theoretical learning. This requires a shift in the way educators and trainers view education and training, placing less emphasis on formal training sessions and more on coaching, mentoring, simulations, case studies, critical incident analyses, and problem-solving in real work environments. In order to produce quality TVET graduates in Pakistan, CBT-based Art & Design education is highly appreciated. However, to activate CBT successfully in Pakistan measures should be taken to eliminate or reduce the above-mentioned barriers highlighted by the teachers.

The summary of the findings helps to conclude that competency-based training programs in Art & Design are relatively more effective than conventional trainings. There was a significant contrast in the execution of TVET curriculum between computer-based training (CBT) and traditional training programs. Teachers expressed greater satisfaction with the implementation of CBT programs for Art & Design, as opposed to the traditional training program.

Limitations

It is a broad research topic and it emphasis on the Challenges and opportunities of Competency-Based Training in Art & Design in Punjab. It was impossible for us to gather data in the province of Punjab even from a single district. Following are the reasons :

1. **Limited Access to Technology:** Access to technology and the internet is limited in many areas of Pakistan, particularly in rural areas. This hinder the collection of data for competency-based trainings, as it may not be feasible to collect data electronically.
2. **Language Barrier:** Pakistan has many regional languages, and not all participants in competency-based trainings may be fluent in English or Urdu. This creates a language barrier that makes it difficult to collect accurate data.
3. **Cultural Differences:** Pakistan is a diverse country with many different cultures and customs. This can impact the way that participants respond to competency-based trainings, and may make it difficult to collect consistent data across different regions and groups.
4. **Limited Resources:** Pakistan is a developing country with limited resources, which can make it challenging to collect data for competency-based trainings. For example, there may be limited funding available to hire staff to collect data, or to purchase equipment needed for data collection.
5. **Security Concerns:** Pakistan has faced security concerns in recent years, which can make it challenging to collect data in certain areas. This can be especially true in conflict-affected regions, where it may not be safe to conduct competency-based trainings or collect data.

6. Political Instability: Pakistan has a history of political instability, which can impact the collection of data for competency-based trainings. For example, changes in government or policies can impact the availability of funding or the ability to conduct trainings in certain areas

So to overcome this issue We limited our research area to the vocational institutes of Lahore as we also belong to this area.

Implications:

This qualitative research on CBT will provide practitioners and policymakers with practical guide to developing, implementing, or refining CBT in Art & Design.

This research has implications for policymakers, teachers, researchers, teacher education institutes, vocational institutes and TEVTA Pakistan. The study outcomes might also be found helpful by the education policymakers in Pakistan in developing vocational training policies. Also, this research may have implications for how preservice teachers perceive CBT and how it can be implemented in vocational institutes.

Recommendations:

The current study employed only a qualitative research design. Future researchers may apply a mixed-methods study design to collect data and see if the findings are consistent with this study.

References

- Achtenhagen, F. (2001). Criteria for the development of complex teaching-learning environments. *Instructional Science*.
- Arguelles, A., & Gonczi, A. E. (2000). *Competency-based education and training: a world perspective*. Mexico City: Grupo Noriega Editors
- Barnett, R. (1994). *The limits of competence: knowledge, higher education and society*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Enkenberg, J. (2001). Instructional design and emerging teaching models in higher education. *Computers in Human Behavior*.
- Giorgi, A. (2009). *The descriptive phenomenological method in psychology: A modified Husserl approach*. Pittsburgh PA. Duquesne University Press.
- Govt. of Pakistan Islamabad, TEVT policy 2017
- Govt. of Pakistan, (2013). *The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013*. National Vocational and Technical Education Commission Prime Minister's Secretariat (Public) Islamabad
- Govt. Policy on the National Skills Strategy (2009-2013). Ministry of education Islamabad
- Hoogveld, A. W. M., Paas, F., Jochems, W. M. G., & van Merriënboer, J. J. G. Van. (2001). The effects of a web-based training in an instructional systems design approach on teachers' instructional design behavior, *Computers in Human Behavior*.
- Klein-Collins, R. (2013, November). *Sharpening our focus on learning: The rise of competency-based approaches to degree completion*. (Occasional Paper No. 20). Urbana, IL: University of Illinois and Indiana University, National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment (NILOA).
- Kerr, S. T., (1996). *Visions of sugarplums: The future of technology, education and the schools*. In S. T. Kerr (Ed.), *Ninety-fifth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education: Part II. Technology and the future of schooling* (pp. 1-27). Chicago: National Society for the Study of Education
- Khan, S., Ahmed, R. R., Streimikiene, D., Streimikis, J., & Jatoi, M. A. (2022). *The Competency-based Training & Assessment, and Improvement of Technical Competencies and Changes in Pedagogical Behavior*. E&M Economics and Management
- Mohan P, Summod W., (2012). *The Skills towards Employment and Productivity (STEP) Skills Measurement Program, Pakistan module*, Unpublished report
- Naquin, S. S., & Holton, E. F., III. (2003). *Motivation to improve work through learning in human resource development*. Human Resource Development International
- Osman, N. W., & Kamis, A. (2019). *The Innovation Leadership Skills for Middle Vocational Leader of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Malaysia*. *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*
- Lincoln YS, Guba EG .(2013). *The constructivist credo*. Left Coast Press, Walnut Creek
- Pratt, D. (1998). *Five perspectives on teaching in adult and higher education*. Malabar, FL: Krieger Publishing Company